The Prayer for the State of Israel

Universalism and Particularism

Rabbi Dalia Marx, PhD

It is a well-known fact that traditional Jewish prayer books contain unflattering wording when referring to non-Jews. Perhaps these exclusive, and sometimes even insulting, expressions served as a coping device: a remedy for Jewish feelings of physical insecurity; a reassurance that God was still on their side; and a reminder that their powerless and, sometimes, humiliated state did not mean that God had abandoned them (as was often claimed by their Christian detractors). The language of chosenness was for many centuries a survival mechanism, the weapon of the weak, a form of spiritual resistance.

In this context, the situation in the State of Israel is unique in Jewish history of the last two millennia. In Israel, Jews are the majority,

Rabbi Dalia Marx, PhD, is a professor of liturgy and midrash at the Jerusalem campus of Hebrew Union College–Jewish Institute of Religion and teaches in various academic institutions in Israel and Europe. Rabbi Marx earned her doctorate at the Hebrew University in Jerusalem and her rabbinic ordination at HUC–JIR in Jerusalem and Cincinnati. She is involved in various research groups and is active in promoting progressive Judaism in Israel. Rabbi Marx contributed to Who by Fire, Who by Water—Un'taneh Tokef, All These Vows—Kol Nidre, We Have Sinned: Sin and Confession in Judaism—Ashamnu and Al Chet, and May God Remember: Memory and Memorializing in Judaism—Yizkor (all Jewish Lights). She writes for academic journals and the Israeli press, and is engaged in creating new liturgies and midrashim.

holding political and economic power in a state where their religion and language are dominant. I prefer to read Balaam's blessing (or, maybe, curse) describing the Israelites as "a people who live apart and does not consider itself one of the nations" (Numbers 23:9) as a question: can a people truly exist separately that way? Israeli Jews must regularly grapple with their connections to non-Iews who dwell in the same land or in neighboring territories.

To some extent, Jewish liturgy is hardly affected by all this—the traditional communities worship from a book that evolved through the centuries but is relatively immune to change today. Still, it is the nature of liturgy to reflect the life of those who use it, especially in progressive circles that welcome new compositions. The liturgy can be expected to reflect the ambivalent situation of Jews who live in a Jewish state but reside alongside Arab Palestinians with whom they are often in a state of tension and hostility.

How, then, does the liturgy capture a Jewish and Israeli perspective on non-Jews living in Israel and outside of it—the various Arab countries all around, and most specifically, the Palestinians? To answer that question, I turn to the Prayer for the State of Israel (PSI). I begin with its predecessors, Jewish prayers for the well-being of the various states and governments where Jews have lived. I then turn to special prayers composed exclusively for the Jewish state, the State of Israel. All of this will lead to some observations on universalism and particularism, inclusivity and exclusivity, in Jewish liturgy.

Prayers for the State

The charge to pray for the welfare of the government goes back all the way to the destruction of the First Temple (587 BCE), when the prophet Jeremiah encouraged the exiles to lead normal lives, to build houses and plant gardens, to marry and have children. Part of this normality would be to "seek the welfare of the city to which I have exiled you and pray to Adonai on its behalf; for with its prosperity you shall prosper" (Jeremiah 29:7).

An interesting paradox underlines this call: the exiles should pray for the welfare of their enemies, but for their own benefit. Jews have known throughout the ages that when the political environment is calm, they are better off.

The rationale for the prayer for the government is reiterated by Rabbi Chanina (first century CE), the assistant high priest, who says, "Pray for the welfare of the government, for were it not for the fear of it, people would devour each other alive" (Pirkei Avot 3:2). Many centuries before Thomas Hobbes, Jewish political philosophy understood, as Ionathan Sarna phrases it, "that a government, even an oppressive government, is superior to anarchy."2

And indeed, we find prayers that Jews have recited throughout the generations for the well-being of their gentile leaders of state.³ The fourteenthcentury Sephardi commentator on the siddur Rabbi David Abudarham described it as commonplace, citing as a proof text the prophet Jeremiah:

> [After reading from the Torah] it is the custom to bless the king and to pray so that [God] would help him and strengthen him over his enemies, for it is written: "And seek the welfare of the city to which I have exiled you and pray to Adonai in its behalf, for in its prosperity you shall prosper" (Jeremiah 29:7). And the welfare of the city is that one prays for the victory of the king over his enemies.⁴

The most familiar prayer for the government, Hanoten T'shuah ("May the One who grants salvation"), appeared in the fifteenth or early sixteenth century and has become the traditional liturgical staple recited in both Ashkenazi and Sephardi congregations after the Torah service on Shabbat. Special versions were sometimes composed for specific leaders, among them King Ferdinand, who together with his wife Queen Isabella expelled the Jews from Spain in 1492!5

The standard text wishes health, success, victory, and prosperity to the ruler, usually specifying his name, and sometimes his wife and children as well. The prayer ends, however, with the wish to behold the redeemer coming to Zion. Here is one version of Hanoten T'shuah:

Hanoten T'shuah

"May the One who grants salvation to kings" (Psalm 144:10) and dominion to princes— His kingdom is an eternal kingdom—

הנותן תשועה "הַנּוֹתֵן הְשׁוּעָה לַמְּלְכִים" (תהלים יְמ"ד, 10), וּמֶמְשְׁלָה לַנְּסִיכִים, מלכותו מלכות כל עולמים,

"the One who delivers David his servant from an evil sword" (ibid.), "who opens a way in the sea, a path in the mighty water" (Isaiah 43:16), bless, keep, protect, help, exalt, magnify, and raise up the president and his vice president, and all the public servants of this land. May [God] cause our enemies to be struck down before them. May He send blessing and success to their every endeavor.

In his mercy may the king over the kings of kings grant them life and guard them and save them from sorrow, and harm, in his mercy may the king, the kings of kings grant them and all their advisors wisdom to do well by us and by all of Israel.

In their days and in our days may ludah be saved, and Israel dwell securely, and may a redeemer come to Zion.

May this be God's will. And let us say: Amen.

"הפוצה את דוד עבדו מחרב רַעַה" (שם, 11). "הנותן בים דרך ובמים עזים נתיבה" (ישעיהו מ"ג, 16), הוא יברד וישמר וינצר ויעזר אָת הַנַשִּיא וְאָת מִשׁנַהוּ וָאֵת כַּל שַׂרֵי הַאָרֵץ הַזֹאת. מֵלֶךְ מַלְכֵי הַמִּלְכִים בַּרַחַמַיו יְחַיֵּם וישמרם ומכל צרה ויגון ונזק יצילם.

וְיַדְבֵּר שׁוֹנְאֵינוּ תַּחְתֵּיהֶם, וישלח בַרכה והצלחה בַּכַּל מַעַשֵּׁי יִדֵיהֵם. מַלֶּךְ מַלְכֵי הַמָּלְכִים בַּרַחַמֵיו יְתֵּן בּלבּם וּבלב כּל יוֹעציהם ושׂריהם לַעֲשׂוֹת טוֹבַה עַמַנוּ וַעָם כַּל ישראל.

בימיהם ובימינו תושע יהודה וִישִׂרָאֵל יִשִׁכּן לָבֵטַח וּבָא לִצִיוֹן גואל.

וָכֶן יָהִי רַצוֹן, וְנֹאמֵר: אַמֵן,

This prayer, which has many versions, brings to bear, as it were, the power of God and the special connection of the Jewish community with God to the benefit of the leaders, and thereby served as proof of Jewish loyalty to them. When (in 1768) the Russian authorities accused the first Chabad leader, Rabbi Shneur Zalman of Liadi, of treason for sending charity to Jews in the Ottoman-occupied Land of Israel, a copy of Hanoten T'shuah written by him was produced as evidence of his loyalty to the czar and his family.⁶

Even during the Soviet era, those Jews who continued to attend synagogue services included (or, more likely, were instructed to include) a prayer for their Communist rulers. We can be sure that many Jews recited this prayer with full intent, but it is also clear that in many cases they said it merely out of duty or even fear. Some even believe that these texts contained some inside jokes, in that the continuation of the biblical citations (which are not quoted in the text) can be read as mockery or even as a curse, hidden beneath the words of praise. "May the One who grants salvation to kings, the One who delivers David his servant from an evil sword" (Psalm 144:10) continues: "Rescue me, and deliver me out of the hand of strangers, whose mouths speak falsehood, and whose right hand is a right hand of falsehood" (Psalm 144:11). The verse "Thus says Adonai, who opens a way in the sea, a path in the mighty water, who brings forth the chariot and horse, the army and the power" (Isaiah 43:16–17) goes on: "They lie down together, they shall not rise; they are extinct, they are quenched as a wick."8

By their nature, these texts deal primarily with the "other"—in this case, the ruler and those in power—and reflect the vulnerable state of Jews who lived as minorities in countries other than their own. They prayed for the rulers, it should be noted; only occasionally did they pray also for the welfare of the country itself or its inhabitants.

Obviously, the Prayer for the State of Israel (PSI), especially as recited by Jews in Israel, presents a completely different case because it is a case of Jews praying for the government of their own Jewish state. But the language of the prayer must inevitably confront that government's attitude toward Israelis who are not Jews and Jews (those living in the diaspora) who are not Israelis.

Given this new situation, rabbinic figures in the young State of Israel sought to distance themselves from the older formula of Hanoten T'shuah by composing a completely new prayer, namely, our Prayer for the State of Israel. It would not seek the welfare of the rulers alone but of the entire country and its inhabitants. The PSI is a significant liturgical breakthrough because Orthodoxy in general is loathe to add anything at all to what has been passed down by tradition. Yet precisely because it was deemed to be a new prayer without prior halakhic precedents and regulations, the PSI was open to enormous creativity—unconfined by classical liturgical formulae.

The PSI versions are sensitive to prevailing religious, ideological, and political sentiment; they readily expose the intentions of those who create them and those who recite them. Indeed, changes to the PSI, even in the official version of the Israeli Chief Rabbinate, can often be traced to specific changes in the political climate within Israel.⁹ These serve as a litmus test for the ongoing tension between universalism and particularism as manifested in the liturgy.

The PSI: A Prayer for the Jewish State

Even before the establishment of the state, some versions of prayers for Israel were composed, either in the traditional formula of *Hanoten* T'shuah or in the form of a Mi Sheberakh supplication. Dozens of such prayers have been created since then.¹⁰

More specifically, however, an official version of the PSI unrelated to these traditionalist formulas came into being in 1948. Its origins have been the subject of some debate, an early opinion being that it originated from the pen of Nobel Prize winner Shmuel Yosef Agnon. We now know, however, that it was composed by Rabbi Isaac Herzog, the Ashkenazi chief rabbi at the time. 11 Let us now look more closely at the version provided by Rabbi Herzog and used not just in Israel but in the diaspora as well.

Our heavenly father, rock of Israel and its redeemer. bless the State of Israel. the first sprouting of our redemption. Shield it with the wing of your grace and spread over it your tabernacle of peace. Shine your light and truth upon its leaders, ministers, and advisors, and grant them good counsel. Strengthen the hands of those who defend our Holy Land, and grant them deliverance and the crown of triumph, and grant peace in the land, and eternal joy for its inhabitants.

אָבֵינוּ שֵׁבַשַׁמֵיִם, צור ישראל וגואלו, בַרַך אָת מִדִינַת יִשֹׂרַאֵל, ראשִׁית צְמִיחַת גִּאֻלָּתֵנוּ. הגן עליה באברת חסדק וּפְרשׁ עָלֶיהָ סָכַּת שָׁלוֹמֵךּ וּשָׁלַח אורָדְּ וַאֲמָתִּדְּ לָרַאשִׁיהַ, שַׂרֵיהַ וְיוֹעֲצֵיהַ, וָתַקנָם בִּעָצַה טוֹבַה מִלְפַנֵיךָּ. חַזָּק אָת יִדֵי מִגְנֵּי אָרֵץ קַדְשׁנוּ וְהַנְחִילֵם אֱלֹהֵינוּ יְשׁוּעַה וַעֲטֵרֶת נָצַחוֹן תִּעַטָּרֶם, ונתת שלום בארץ ושמחת עולם ליושביה.

Remember favorably our kinfolk of Israel throughout the lands of their dispersion, and lead them guickly and upright to Zion, your city, and Jerusalem, the dwelling place of your name, as it is written in the Torah of Moshe your servant: "If any of you that are dispersed be in the uttermost parts of heaven, from thence will Adonai your God

gather you, and from there will He take you. And Adonai your God will bring you into the land that your ancestors possessed, and you shall possess it; and He will do you good, and multiply you above your ancestors.

And Adonai your God will circumcise your heart, and the heart of your seed, to love Adonai your God with all your heart, and with all your soul, that you may live" (Deuteronomy 30:4-6). And unite our hearts to love and revere your name, and to observe all the words of your Torah.

And bring forth swiftly the son of David, your righteous messiah, to redeem those who eternally await your salvation.

ואת אחינו כל בית ישראל, פַּקַדנַא בַּכַּל אַרצות פּזוּרִיהַם וְתוֹלִיכֵם מְהֵרָה קוֹמִמִיּוּת לְצִיּוֹן עירך, וַלִירוּשַלֵים מִשְׁכַּן שְמֵך, כַּכַתוּב בַּתוֹרַת משה עַבְדֵּךְ: "אָם יָהָיֶה נָדַחַדְּ בָּקְצֶה הַשְּׁמֵיִם משם יקבּצָּדְ יִי אֵלהֵידְ וּמִשַׁם יַקָּחֶך: וֶהֶבִיאֲדְ יְיָ אֵלהֵיךְ אֵל האַרץ אשר יַרשוּ אַבתיך וירשתה והיטבד והרבד מאַבוֹתֵיךּ וּמַל יִיַ אֵלהֵיךּ אַת לבַבָּדְ וָאָת לַבַב זַרְעַדְּ לְאַהַבַה אָת יִי אֵלהֵיךּ בִּכַּל לְכַבְךְּ וּבַכַל־נַפִשׁךְּ לְמַעַן חַיֵּיךְ״ (דברים ל, ד־ו).

ויחד לבבנו לאהבה וליראה את שמה

וָלְשָׁמוֹר אֵת כַּל דִּבְרֵי תּורַתֵּדְ, ושלַח לַנוּ מִהָרָה בֵּן דַּוָד מִשֵׁיחַ צדקה

> לָפִדוֹת מִחַכֵּי קֵץ יִשׁוּעַתֶּךְּ וָהוֹפַע בַּהַדַר גִּאוֹן עִזֵּךְ על כּל יוֹשבי תַבל ארצּה,

Reveal Yourself in your glorious majesty to all the inhabitants of your world. Let everything that breathes proclaim: his majesty rules over all. Amen, selah.

ויאמר כל אשר נשמה באפו: יָיָ אֱלהֵי יִשְׂרָאֵל מֶלֶּךְ ומַלְכוּתוֹ בַּכּל מָשֵׁלַה. אמן סלה.

The prayer begins in a lofty and poetic style before reverting to less flowery prose dependent on proof-texting from biblical verses. It requests the following:

- a. Peace and protection for the state, as the "first sprouting of our redemption"
- b. Wisdom for its leaders
- c. The victory and safety of Israel's soldiers and defenders
- d. Ingathering of diaspora Jews
- e. Success in Israel for the religious mandates of tradition
- f. Redemption and the coming of the messiah
- g. Acceptance of God by all the inhabitants of the world

The perspective of the prayer is Israeli and Jewish: it concentrates on the State of Israel and its role. It deals at length with diaspora Jews, calling upon God to bring them home to Israel. Non-Jewish citizens of the state go unmentioned specifically but may be included in the petition for "eternal joy for its inhabitants." Humanity in general is subsumed only in the traditional context of their ultimate messianic acceptance of God's kingdom. This is, in sum, fully in keeping with traditional Judaism's hope for the ingathering of exiles and the ultimate triumph of God throughout the world.

According to Joel Rappel, an Israeli scholar who examined the evolution and history of the official PSI, Herzog deliberately rejected early versions that began with the traditional words Hanoten T'shuah because he saw them as symbolizing Jewish powerlessness and submissiveness to the foreign ruler. He made it a point to compose a completely new prayer, which would stress Jewish sovereignty and independence.

But the PSI is conversant with another emotionally charged document of the time, the Declaration of the Establishment of the State of Israel, signed by the members of the Provisional Government, on the day of the establishment of Israel, May 14, 1948 (5 Iyar 5708). The two texts share linguistic expressions of major national values that characterized the young state. We may go so far as to see PSI as a religious response to the Declaration and to those civil religious sentiments that the Declaration defined. Indeed, the very fact that it has the Declaration in mind may be the reason that ultra-Orthodox circles in Israel have rejected it so fiercely, 12 even though (as we shall see) it by no means accepts the secular views that the Declaration so clearly proclaims.

The Declaration was fully a modern civil document, a reflection of the world in which the fledgling secular state found itself. It necessarily addressed the different categories of "others," people, that is, who did not fall into the category of Jewish Israelis. Here are the relevant paragraphs from the Declaration of Independence, with the categories italicized:

> The State of Israel ... will foster the development of the country for the benefit of all its inhabitants; it will be based on freedom, justice and peace as envisaged by the prophets of Israel; it will ensure complete equality of social and political rights to all its inhabitants irrespective of religion, race or sex; it will guarantee freedom of religion, conscience, language, education and culture; it will safeguard the Holy Places of all religions; and it will be faithful to the principles of the Charter of the United Nations.

> We appeal to the United Nations to assist the Jewish people in the upbuilding of its State and to receive the State of Israel into the community of nations.

> We appeal—in the very midst of the onslaught launched against us now for months—to the Arab inhabitants of the State of Israel to preserve peace and participate in the upbuilding of the State on the basis of full and equal citizenship and due representation in all its provisional and permanent institutions.

> We extend our hand to all neighboring states and their peoples in an offer of peace and good neighborliness, and appeal to them to establish bonds of cooperation and mutual help with the sovereign Jewish people settled in its own land.

The State of Israel is prepared to do its share in a common effort for the advancement of the entire Middle East.

Next comes an appeal for the diaspora Jews to unite around the cause of the young state:

> We appeal to the Jewish people throughout the Diaspora to rally round the Jews of Eretz-Israel in the tasks of immigration and upbuilding and to stand by them in the great struggle for the realization of the age-old dream—the redemption of Israel.

The PSI, in contrast to the Declaration, contains almost no reference to any of the following: the community of nations, the Arab inhabitants of Israel, or the neighboring states or their peoples. ¹³ The difference between the texts can partially be explained by the fact that the Declaration is a political statement meant for both Jews and the "community of nations," whereas the PSI is a text specifically meant for Jewish worship. 14 Still, the utter lack of references to non-Jews demands our attention. Rappel maintains that Herzog deliberately refrained from including them, just as he avoided the old, submissive Hanoten T'shuah formula. Instead, he created a liturgical text that deals solely with Israel from a Jewish perspective and a call to diasporan Jews to return to it.

We see, then, that Herzog's purview remained within the traditionalistic mind-set that he had inherited from his Jewish past: he viewed the state from the perspective of its heralding the next great stage in God's plan for the ultimate messianic rule that had been promised through the eons. Although couched in new language, the prayer's sentiment remained fully in keeping with traditional Jewish liturgy's accent on the coming of God's kingdom at the end of time.

Later PSIs, however, composed in Israel as well as in the diaspora, and especially in non-Orthodox contexts, deal also with non-Jews in a variety of ways. Let us explore some of them now.

Universalism and Particularism in the Prayers for the State of Israel

The Herzog prayer was not the only one to find its way into Jewish liturgies. Indeed, in the following decades, a variety of alternatives have appeared in

Israel, North America, and Europe. A convenient starting point for our survey is the PSI found in *Ha'avodah Shebalev*, Israeli Reform version (1982), the prayer book of the Progressive Movement in Israel and, therefore, both Reform and Israeli, with a strong Zionist perspective¹⁵ and a liberal point of view. While directly citing the Herzog PSI in part, it also provides significant variations and an altogether different theology and ideology:

Rock of Israel and its redeemer. bless the State of Israel. the first sprouting of our redemption. Shield it with the wing of your grace and spread over it your tabernacle of peace. Shine your light and truth upon its leaders, judges, and officials. Grant them good council so that they may follow the path of righteousness, liberty, and justice. Strengthen the hands of those who defend our Holy Land, and grant them salvation and life. Grant peace to this land and everlasting joy to its inhabitants. Remember favorably our kinfolk of the house of Israel throughout the lands of their dispersion. Plant the love of Zion within their hearts. and may there be those among them—may God be with them who shall come to Jerusalem, your city that bears your name. Spread your spirit over all the inhabitants of our land.

צור ישראל וגואלו, בַּרֶךְ אֵת מִדִינַת יִשֹראֵל, ראשית צמיחת גאלתנו. הגן עליה באברת חסדק וּפְרשׁ עֶלֶיהָ סָכַּת שׁלוֹמֵךָּ. שלח אורד ואמתד לראשיה, לשופטיה ולנבחריה, וָתַקָּנֵם בָּעָצַה טוֹבַה מִלְפַנֵיךָ, למען ילכו בדרך הצדק, החפש והישר חַזָּק אָת יְדֵי מִגְנֵּי אָרֶץ קַדְשֵׁנוּ, וָהַנָּחִילֵם יִשׁוּעַה וְחַיִּים. ונתת שלום בארץ ושמחת עולם ליושביה. פקד נא לברכה את אחינוּ בּית ישׂראל בכל ארצות פזוריהם. טע בּלְבַם אַהַבַת צִיּוֹן, וּמִי בָהֶם מִכָּל עַמֵנוּ יהי אלהיו עמו ויעל לירושלים ערך, אַשר נִקרָא שַׁמִּדְּ עַלֵּיהַ. Uproot from us hatred and animosity, zealotry and evil. Plant in our hearts love and amity, peace and friendship. Speedily fulfill the vision of your prophet: "Nation shall not lift up sword against nation, neither shall they learn war any more" (Isaiah 2:4). And let us say: Amen.

הַאָצֵל מֵרוּחַךּ עַל כַּל יוֹשְבֵי ארצנו, הָסֵר מִקּרְבֵּנוּ שִנִּאָה וְאֵיבָה, קּנְאַה ורשעות, וטע בּלבּנוּ אַהַבה ואַחוה, שלום ורעות. וָקָיֶם בָּמָהֶרָה חַזוֹן נָבִיאֵדְּ: רֹא יִשָּׂא גוֹי אֶל גּוֹי חֱרֶב" ולא ילמדוּ עוֹד מלחמה" (ישעיהו ב, ד). וְנֹאמֵר: אֲמֵן.

The call for the ingathering of the exiles is significantly toned down, while the diaspora is viewed as a valid Jewish choice: to be sure, some "shall come to Jerusalem, your city that bears your name"; but this hope is balanced by the prayer that God "remember favorably our kinfolk of the house of Israel throughout the lands of their dispersion." Requesting victory by the military is replaced by a concern for its soldiers' well-being. Instead of petitions for the coming of the messiah, we get an emphasis on understanding and fellowship among all the inhabitants of the land.

The current situation is viewed, at least partly, as suffering from "hatred and animosity, zealotry and evil," which require healing. In conclusion, we get a wish for the fulfillment of Isaiah's prophecy of peace—a passage that (in practice) is typically sung.

Relating to the State of Israel as "the first sprouting of our redemption" has proved especially problematic over the years. Many have been troubled by its messianic pretensions, holding that the State of Israel does not merit the title. Seeing the state as already redemptive, moreover, has led some extremists to demand a post-historical morality that permits violence toward Arabs. 16 This liberal version of the prayer therefore strikes a balance. It does see Israel as "the first sprouting of our redemption," but the image of redemption is a far cry from the traditionalistic portrait that includes all Jews being restored to their homeland and the rest of humanity converted to the true vision of the one and unique Jewish God.

The parallel prayer found in *Mishkan T'filah*, the North American Reform siddur (2007), abbreviates the official text but adds an English sentence that does not appear in the Hebrew text at all. It turns the petition "Bless the State of Israel, first sprouting of our redemption" into a call for peace: "Bless the State of Israel which marks the dawning of the hope for all who seek peace."

Finding a PSI in a North American Reform siddur is not a given. It is, of course, absent from the older Union Prayer Book, whose three editions (1895, 1918, and 1940) were published before the establishment of the State of Israel. Classical reformers were, in any case, wary of Zionism, if not explicitly against it.¹⁷ More surprising is the absence of a PSI in the newer Gates of Prayer (1975), which was published in a time of growing affinity toward the young state and support of Zionism. Rabbi Lawrence A. Hoffman, PhD, maintains that the editors were opposed to the phrase "first sprouting of our redemption" and therefore left the prayer out. Instead, a short paragraph asking God's blessing on the state was appended to the prayer "For Our People and Our Nation" (p. 452). The final paragraph requests God's favor "upon Israel, her land, her people" and reframes "first sprouting of our redemption" as "the promise of her beginning," which "may ripen into fulfillment." 18

The United Kingdom provides three progressive alternatives: the Masorti Movement, akin to North America's Conservative Jews; the Liberal Movement, very much like North American Reform; and the Reform Movement, which shares the philosophy of the Liberal Movement but is somewhat more traditional ritually. The Liberal Siddur Lev Chadash (1995) has the following prayer, which appears in English only:

> Eternal God, our Rock and Redeemer, grant blessing to the State of Israel, created to fulfill an age-old dream and to be a haven for the oppressed. Inspire its leaders and citizens with faithfulness to the aims of its founders: to develop the land for the benefit of all its inhabitants, and to implement the Prophetic ideals of liberty and justice. May they live in harmony with one another and in peace with their neighbours, and cause to come true once more the ancient vision that "out of Zion shall go forth Torah and the word of God from Jerusalem" (Isaiah 2:3).

This Liberal offering emphasizes Israel's commitment to its initial aims. If the Herzog original reacts negatively to the Declaration of Independence of the State of Israel, this prayer responds positively, most notably where it says, "To develop the land for the benefit of all its inhabitants, and to implement the Prophetic ideals of liberty and justice." Whether by accident or design, it falls short of explicitly referring to Israel as a Jewish state or as the homeland of all Jews.

The British Reform Movement siddur, Forms of Prayer (Seder Ha-T'fillot, 2008), pursues the same line of thought as the Liberal siddur but provides a Hebrew equivalent and makes reconciliation and the desire for peace in Israel its main focus:

Our God and God of the generations, we ask your blessing upon the State of Israel and all who dwell in it. Send your light and your truth to the people, and guide them with wisdom and understanding, so that peace and tranquility may reign on its borders and in its homes. May the spirit of friendship and understanding remove all fears and heal all wounds. There, may mercy and truth come together for the good of all, so that your promise is fulfilled: "for Torah shall come out of Zion and the word of God from Jerusalem'' (Isaiah 2:3). Amen.

אַלהֵינוּ וַאלהֵי כַּל־הַדּוֹרוֹת שָׁלַח נָא בִּרְכָתְדָּ עַל מְדִינַת יִשְׂרָאֵל וְעַל כַּל יוֹשָבֵיהַ. שָׁלַח נַא אוֹרְדְּ ואַמִתַּתָּדְּ לְמַנָּהִיגִי־הַעָם וְהַדְרִיכֶם בַחַכְמַה ובתבונה כָדֵי שֵישרור שַׁלוֹם בָּגִבוּלוֹתֵיהַ וְשַׁלְוַה בְּבַתֵּיהַ. רוּח אחוה והבנה הדדית תַרְפַּא כַּל פַּצַע וַחַבּוּרַה. תַּקוַת עַמַה וַעַבוֹדַת בַּנֵיהַ תַּגִשַׁמִנָה אָת חַזוֹן הנביאים, "כי מציון תצא תורה וּדָבַר יִיָ מִירוּשָׁלַיִם״ (ישעיהו ב, ג). אַמֵן.

The prayer was composed by Rabbi Lionel Blue for the British Reform Movement's 1977 liturgy (Forms of Prayer) and was reprinted in its 2008 successor with some minor changes for the sake of inclusive language. 19 It is deliberately and emphatically universalistic, in that it seeks God's "blessing upon the State of Israel and all who dwell in it." It evokes "the spirit of friendship and understanding" to "remove all fears and heal all wounds." Isaiah 2:3 was chosen as its closing verse, probably because it had been part of the PSI inherited from Great Britain's venerable Singer prayer book,²⁰ a prayer book that had become synonymous with traditional

British practice and was consulted by non-Orthodox movements there. This verse from the PSI in Singer was also included by the Liberal prayer book (cited above) but had already been borrowed by Blue, who prefaced his Reform version, however, with the universalizing emphasis: "There, may mercy and truth come together for the good of all mankind" (the word "mankind" was changed in the 2008 edition to "all").

The first contemporary German Reform prayer book emerged in 2009, T'filot l'khol hashanah: Jüdisches Gebetbuch, under the editorship of Rabbi Andreas Nachama and Jonah Sievers. Its PSI provides a short adaptation of the official version, with some conspicuous changes:²¹

Our heavenly father, Rock of Israel and its redeemer. Bless the State of Israel. So that it may be the first sprouting of our redemption. Fulfill through it the words of the Scriptures: "For out of Zion shall go forth Torah and the word of God from Jerusalem'' (Isaiah 2:3). Spread a tabernacle of peace over the whole world: And may all the inhabitants of the world dwell in safety. And let us say: Amen.

אבינוּ שבשמים, צור ישראל וגואלו, בַּרָךְ אֵת מִדִינַת יִשֹרַאֵל, תָהָיָה רֵאשִׁית צְמִיחַת גָּאָלַתֵנוּ. וָקַיֶּם בַּה מִקְרָא שֶׁכַּתוּב: ״כִּי מִצִיּוֹן תֵּצֵא תּוֹרָה וּדְבַר יִיַ ַמִירוּשַלֵיִם" (ישעיהו ב, ג). וּפָרשׁ סָכַת שַׁלוֹם עַל כָּל הָעוֹלָם. וכל יושבי תבל ישכנו לבטח. וַכֶּן יָהִי רַצוֹן, וְנֹאמֵר: אֲמֵן.

As with the traditional versions, this one too discusses the rise of the State of Israel as "the first sprouting of our redemption." Like Singer and the other British prayer books mentioned here, it then cites Isaiah 2:3 and moves on quickly to the well-being of the entire world, without special references to Israel or Jews. The "tabernacle of peace" that the official PSI would have God spread over Israel is here generalized, extending to the entire world. Like the European texts from England (cited above), this one too ignores the concept of "others" altogether.

A subtle but important feature of the German version is the way it deals with the implications of "the first sprouting of our redemption."

Rather than have it refer to the past, as if Israel has already entered messianic times, it projects the phrase into the future: "So that it may be the first sprouting of our redemption." It is hard to read this emendation of the English as anything less than a critique of traditionalists who see Israel as necessarily conferring messianic status on the present. In concept, it is reminiscent of Gates of Prayer (above), which, as we saw, preferred praying that "the promise of her [Israel's] beginning may ripen into fulfillment."²²

So far, we have sampled a variety of denominational prayer books, but the liturgical landscape contains as well a number of liturgies published by nondenominational institutions, communities, and even individuals; many of them have published their own versions of PSI. A good example is the prayer composed by Rabbis for Human Rights (RHR), founded in 1988, the only Israeli rabbinic organization comprising Orthodox, Conservative, and Reform rabbis. RHR revises the text from time to time; these are the 2013 Hebrew and English versions:

Sovereign of the Universe, accept in loving kindness and with favor our prayers for the State of Israel, her government and all who dwell within her boundaries and under her authority.

On the sixty-fifth anniversary of her founding, reopen our eyes and our hearts to the wonder of Israel and strengthen our faith in your power to work redemption in every human soul. Grant us also the fortitude to keep ever before us those ideals to which Israel dedicated herself in her Declaration of Independence, so that we may be true partners with the people of Israel in working toward her as yet not fully fulfilled vision.

רבּוֹן העוֹלם, קבַּל נא בַּרחמים וברצון את תפלתנו למען מדינת יִשְׁרָאֵל, מֵמִשְׁלְתַּה וְכַל הַדָּרִים בגבוליה ותחת שליטתה.

פַּקַח נַא אָת עִינֵינוּ וַלְבֵּנוּ מַחַדַשׁ לַנִּפְלָא שֶׁבִּקיוּמָה וְחַזֵּק אֵת אמונתנו בכחד להביא גאולה לְכַל נִשַּמָה. תֵן לַנוּ אֵת הַאִּמֵץ וההתמדה לראות תמיד לנגד עינינוּ אָת הַעָקרוֹנוֹת שַהְצֵיבַה לעצמה ישראל במגילת הַעַצְמַאוּת. הַבָּא לְכַךְ שֵׁנָּהֵיָה שתפי אָמֶת עם אַזְרָחֵי ישראַל בַּהשַגת הַחַזוֹן שַטַרָם נִשַּלם במלאו.

Grant those entrusted with guiding Israel's destiny the courage, wisdom and strength to do your will. Guide them in the paths of peace and give them the insight to see your Image in every human being. Be with those charged with Israel's safety and defend them from all harm. May they have the strength to protect their country and the spiritual fortitude never to abuse the power placed in their hands. Spread your blessings over the Land. May justice and human rights abound for all her inhabitants. Guide them "To do justice, love mercy and walk humbly with your God" (Micah 6:8), and "May justice well up like water, righteousness like a mighty stream" (Amos 5:24). Implant tolerance and mutual respect in every heart, and may all realize that "we were not brought into this world for conflict and dissension, nor for hatred, jealousy, harassment or bloodshed. Rather. we were brought into this world in order to recognize You, may You be blessed forever" (Rabbi Nachman of Breslov). Spread over Israel and all the world your shelter of peace, and may the vision of

תֵן לְכַל הַעוֹסְקִים בִּצַרְכֵי צְבּוּר אָת אָמֶץ הַלָּב, הַתְבוּנַה וְהַכַּחַ לַעֲשוֹת רָצוֹנְךְּ כָּלֶבַב שַׁלֶם. הַדְרֵךְ אותם בנתיבות שלום והענק לָהֶם אֶת הָרְאִיָה לְהַכִּיר אֵת צֵלֵם אַלהַים בָּכַל אַדַם. חַזָּק אָת מִגִינֵּי אָרַץ קַדְשֵׁנוּ וְהַגֵּן עַלֵּיהָם מִפְּנִי אוֹיַב, חַרָב, סַכַּנַה וִיגוֹן. טַע בַּהַם עז להגן על מולדתם והאצל עֲלֵיהֶם אֶת גְבוּרֵת הַנֵּפֵשׁ לְכִבּוֹשׁ אָת יצר השלטון והכח. הַרַק אָת בַּרַכַתְדְּ עַל הַאַרֵץ וְעַל כַּל יוֹשַבֵיהַ. יִמַצאוּ בַה צֵדֶק וּזָכִיּוֹת אַדַם לְכַל אַדַם. הַשְׁרֵשׁ בָּלֵב כִּלָם אֵת מוּסַר נִבִיאֵיךְ "עשות משפט ואַהַבת חָסֶד והצנע לכת עם אַלהידְ" (מיכה ו, ח) "וְיגַל כַּמַיָם מִשְׁפַּט וּצְדַקָה פָנַחַל אֵיתַן" (עמוס ה, כד) לְמַעַן יִלְמַדוּ דַרְכִי סוֹבַלְנוּת וְכַבוֹד הַדַדִי. יָהִי רַצוֹן שַׁכַּל יוֹשָבֵי הַאַרֵץ יַכַּירוּ כִּי "לֹא בַאנוּ לְזֵה הַעוֹלַם בִּשְׁבִיל ריב ומחלקת ולא בשביל שנאה וָקנָאַה וָקנָטוּר וּשָׁפִיכוּת דַּמִים. ַרַק בַּאנוּ לַעוֹלַם כָּדֵי לְהַכִּיר אוֹתְדְּ תתברך לנצח (ר' נחמן מברסלב). פרש על ישראל ועל כל תבל your prophet soon be fulfilled: "Nation shall not lift up sword against nation, neither shall they learn war any more" (Isaiah 2:4). So may it be your will that speedily and in our day all inhabitants of the earth will say of the State of Israel, "It is very good" (Genesis 1:31), for she will have become a blessing to the entire world and a "light unto the nations" (Isaiah 42:6).

את ספת שלומד וקים במהרה חזון נביאך: "לא ישא גוי אל גוי "חֶרֶב וְלֹא יִלְמְדוּ עוֹד מִלְחַמֵּה (ישעיהו, ב, ד).יְהִי רָצוֹן מִלְפְנֶיךְ שׁיֹאמָרוּ [בַּמָהֵרָה בַיַמֵנוּ] כַּל יוֹשָׁבֵי תֵבֵל "הָנֵה טוֹב מִאֹד", פִּי יִתִבֶּרִכוּ בִּמִדִינַת יִשְׁרַאֵל כַּל מְשַׁפַּחוֹת הַאַדַמַה.

The very length of the prayer indicates how important it was to its authors. Rather than settle for general statements regarding peace, it specifies those to whom it refers: "All who dwell within her boundaries and under her authority," a description that seems intended to encompass not only Israeli citizens but also Palestinians in the West Bank. It then expresses its wishes for the redemption of "every human soul." Appropriately, the RHR prayer explicitly references the Declaration of Independence, which the original Herzog version had pointedly omitted. We are to "keep ever before us those ideals to which Israel dedicated herself in her Declaration of Independence," a reminder of the commitments that those who signed it took upon themselves, commitments that bind us as well.

This version emanates from within Israel itself; its authors choose, therefore—like the official PSI and the Israeli Reform version (but unlike many of the diaspora PSI texts)—to call upon God for help in defending the Land from its enemies. God is to strengthen "those charged with Israel's safety." Like the Israeli Reform siddur (and unlike the Herzog text), it does not ask for victory; instead, it focuses on safety and security. Uniquely, however, it also requests spiritual fortitude "never to abuse the power placed in their hands." Unlike diaspora PSI texts, this prayer places Israel at the center of attention even as it seeks for Israel to be a source of well-being for the entire world.

If Rabbis for Human Rights epitomizes institutions intent on publishing alternative PSI texts, then Rabbi Aryeh Cohen, a professor at the American Jewish University, personifies individuals who have turned to the task on their own. Convinced of "a large and growing number of people who would like to include Israel in their prayers in all of its complexity and are unable to intone the Chief Rabbinate's liturgy,"23 the author set about creating something better. "In my mind," he continues,

> I framed the prayer between two powerful religious and literary moments. On the one hand, Rabbi Yehudah Halevi's famous line: "My heart is in the east, and I am at the far reaches of the west." On the other hand, Isaiah's statement "Zion will be redeemed with justice, and those who return to her with righteousness" (Isaiah 1:27). The piyyut is a movement between those two poles.²⁴

In other words, the prayer captures the Jewish People's eternal longing for Zion and, at the same time, a demand that Zion redeemed shall be governed justly. The first verse addresses Zion; the second and third verses address God:

תפילה **Prayer**

My heart, my heart goes out to you, Zion. Tears and jubilation, celebration and grieving Did we not dream a dream that came to be?

And here it is—both song and lament.

We are mere matter, and our prayer is to the Creator Toward the Good and the Just, direct the people in refuge in Zion For yours is all the world, and we have but one land.

Which we inherited together with the sons and daughters of Hagar.

לבי לבי יוצא לך ציון. דּמַעוֹת וִצָהַלַה, שָּׁמְחַה וִיַגוֹן הַלֹא חַלוֹם חַלַמנוּ וַיָהִי וְהָנַה-גַם רְנַה גַם נַהִי.

נַחָנוּ רַק חָמֵר וּתִפַּלַה לַנוּ לַיּוֹצֵר, לַטוֹב וַלַצֵּדָק הַכוּן אֶת הַעם בַּצִיּוֹן מִסְתַּתֵּר. פָּי לְדַ כַּל הַאָרֵץ וַלְנוּ אָרֵץ יִחִידַה, אשר ירשנו יחדיו עם בני הגר. Favor us with knowledge with which to understand The wisdom of Avraham, "If you will go left, I will go right" (Genesis 13:9). Overflow with mercy on a great and troubled land. For "7ion will be redeemed in judgment and its inhabitants in justice" (Isaiah 1:27).²⁵

חָנֵנוּ דַעַת אֲשֵׁר בּוֹן נַבִין חַכִמַת אַבָרָהָם: "אָם תַּשְׂמְאֶילָה ואימין" (בראשית יג, ט) רחמים תשפיע על ארץ רבה הגזירה. כִּי ״צִיּוֹן בָּמִשְׁפַט תִפַּדָה וְשַׁבֵיהַ בָּצְדַקַה" (ישעיהו א, כז).

Cohen composed his text in the middle of the Second Intifada, and it is used by the members of the Shtibl Minyan in Los Angeles. It concentrates on the relationship between the children of Abraham, both Jews and Muslims-or, to be more exact, the Palestinians. It neglects other matters, however, even the all-important consideration of Israel as a Jewish homeland. It thus constitutes the mirror image of the official PSI, in that Herzog ignores the non-Jewish dwellers in Israel, while Cohen makes them his main issue.

A second individual composition worth looking at comes from Moshe Greenberg, a Bible professor and Conservative rabbi. Greenberg was born in Philadelphia and emigrated to Israel in 1970. Cohen's text, we saw, condensed the PSI into a single solitary theme. Greenberg's 1989 version attempts the opposite: it seeks to include as many relevant topics as possible:

We are grateful to you, the Eternal, our God, for having woken your people to found a nation in the land that you bequeathed to our ancestors, and for having graced us with a surviving remnant and a revival after the murderous destruction that the wicked of the world brought upon us.

מודים אנחנו לך יִיַ אלהינו, על שעוררת את בני עמך להקים מדינה בארץ שהנחלת לאבותינו, ועל שחננתנו שארית ותקומה לאחר ההשמדה שהמיטו עלינו רשעי העולם.

Now, our God, our eyes turn to you to give us wisdom to govern our nation, and counsel to make peace with our enemies. and love for our fellow children of Israel inside our land and beyond it so that we might become one body to sanctify your name across the world, for it is for that that we were created.

Our hands are stained with insolence and blunders that have fenced in our ways with thorns. We hoped for the good and aimed toward justice, but the leaven in our dough soured our deeds. We know not what we are to do; therefore our prayer is laid out before you that you will give us the wisdom to find our paths to our foes' hearts, and that you will direct their heart to make peace with us, and that you will spare our hands and theirs from killing and terror, and uproot from our midst thoughts of destruction and hatred.

Strengthen our hands to build our country, and to pepetuate what we have undertaken:

To prepare for the ingathering of the exiles: to watch over the development of the land for the good of all its inhabitants; to perpetuate social and legal equal rights for each and every citizen; to ensure

ועתה אלהינו, לך עינינו תלויות לתת לנו חכמה לכלכל את מדינתנו. ועצה להשלים עם אויבינו, ואהבת אחינו בני ישראל בארץ ובחוצה לה למען ניעשה אגודה אחת לקדש שמר בעולם, כי לכך נוצרנו. בידינו זדונות ושגגות אשר שכו את דרכינו בקוצים: קיווינו לטוב וכיוונו לצדק, אבל השאור שבעיסתנו החמיץ את מעשינו.

אנחנו לא נדע מה נעשה, ועל כן תפילתנו שטוחה לפניך כי תחכימנו למצוא מסילות ללבבם של צרינו, וכי תטה את לבבם להשלים עמנו, וכי תחשוך את ידינו ואת ידיהם מהרג וחבלה, ותעקור מקרבנו מחשבות הרס ושנאה. חזק את ידינו לבנין מדינתנו, לקיים את אשר קיבלנו על

עצמנו בקומה: להיכון לקראת עלייה יהודית ולקיבוץ גלויות;

לשקוד על פיתוח הארץ לטובת כל תושביה: לקיים שיוויון זכויות חברתי freedom of religion, conscience, language, education, and culture to all of our citizens. May it be your will to help us meet our obligations for the sake of your glorious name, whose name we bear, so that through us the word of your prophet will be fulfilled: "You are my servant, Israel, and through you I shall be glorfied" (Isaiah 49:3).

ומדיני לכל אזרח ואזרח: להבטיח חופש דת, מצפון, לשון, חינוך ותרבות לכל אזרחינו. יהי רצון מלפניך שתסייע בידינו לעמוד בהתחייבויותינו למען כבוד שמך הנקרא עלינו, ויקוים בנו דבר נביאך: "עבדי "אתה ישראל אשר בך אתפאר (ישעיהו מט, ג).

This PSI begins by offering gratitude and then specifies its petitions. It asks for wisdom to reconcile with the enemy, acknowledging the failure thus far to manage it on our own. Like the Rabbis for Human Rights' PSI, it cites some key sentences relating to "others" from the Declaration of Independence. It ends with a request for help so that we may meet our commitments to God. This is also virtually the only text that explicitly refers to the Holocaust.²⁶ As far as I know, this text is not in current use.

Having dealt with denominational and then personal PSIs, we should also look at a version that is used in a specific congregation. I chose Mevakshei Derekh, a Reconstructionist-oriented congregation in Jerusalem, which is very engaged with liturgy and its meaning. This is a rather unique congregation on the Israeli liberal scene, since it uses a traditional prayer book (albeit with a few minor changes). In the case of the PSI, Mevakshei Derekh has two alternative versions of the prayer. The first is in use in other congregations in Israel, some modern Orthodox and some Masorti; the second is recited only at Mevakshei Derekh. Here is the first prayer; it is quite well known, but I could not trace its author:

Sovereign of the Universe, mercifully accept our prayer for the State of Israel and its government. Pour out your blessing upon the land and upon those who faithfully

רַבּוֹן הַעוֹלַם, קַבָּל נַא בְּרַחַמִים אָת תִּפִּלַתֵנוּ בִּעַד מִדִינַת יִשְׂרַאָל וּמֶמְשַׁלְתָּה. הָרֵק אֶת בִּרְכָתְךְּ עַל הַאָרֵץ וְעַל הַעוֹסְקִים בָּצַרְכֵי צְבּוּר

deal with the needs of the public. Guide them according to the laws of your Torah, and teach them to understand your precepts, in order that the land never be deprived of peace and tranquility, happiness and freedom, Please Fternal, God of the spirit of all flesh, reveal your spirit upon all the inhabitants of our land, and instill within them love and fraternity, peace and friendship, and uproot from their hearts all hatred and animosity, jealously and competition. And remember all of our fellow members of the House of Israel, in all the lands in which they are dispersed, and lead them quickly upright to Zion, your city, and to leruselam, your habitation. Strenghten the hands of those who defend our holy land, and grant them salvation, and crown them with the crown of victory. And grant peace in the land, and eternal joy to its inhabitants. And so may it be your will that our land be a blessing to all the inhabitants of the world. And may there abide among them friendship and freedom, and quickly establish the vision of your prophet: "Nation shall not lift up sword against nation, neither shall they learn war anymore" (Isaiah 2:4). Amen.

בַּאֵמוּנָה. הוֹרֶם מֵחְקֵי תּוֹרָתֶּךְּ, הַבִינֵם מִשִּׁפַטֵי צִדְקֵהְ, לִמַעַן לֹא יַסורו מאַרצַנוּ שַלוֹם וַשַׁלְוַה, אשר וחפש כל הימים. אנאיי אלהי הרוחות לכל בשר, הַעַרָה רוּחַךְּ עַל כַּל תּוֹשַׁבֵי אַרַצַנוּ, וְטַע בַּהֶם אַהַבַה וְאַחַוַה, שַׁלוֹם וָרֶעוּת, וַעֲקר מִלְבַם כַּל שִׁנָאַה ואיבה, קנאה ותחרות. וְאֵת אַחֵינוּ כַּל בֵּית יִשְׂרָאֵל פִּקֹד נַא בָּכַל אַרִצוֹת פַּזוּרֵיהֶם וְתוֹלִיכֶם מהרה קוממיות לציון עירך וְלִירוּשַלֵיִם מִשְׁכֵּן שְׁמֵךָּ. חוק את ידי מגני ארץ קדשנו והנחילם ישועה, ועטרת נצחון תעטרם. ונתת שלום בארץ וִשְׂמָחַת עוֹלַם לִיוֹשָׁבֵיהַ. וָכֶן יָהִי רַצוֹן שַׁתָּהָא אַרְצֵנוּ בָּרַכַה לְכַל יוֹשָׁבֵי תֵּבָל. וְתַשַׁרֵה בֵּינֵיהֶם רַעוּת וְחֵרוּת, וְקַיֵּם בַּמָהֵרָה חַזוֹן נביאך: "לא ישא גוי אל גוי חרב ולא ילמדו עוד מלחמה". אמן.

This is a new formulation of the prayer, independent of the structure of the official PSI composed by Rabbi Herzog but bearing some thematic resemblance to it. Instead of referring to Israel as the "first sprouting of our redemption," it expresses the hope that it may become a blessing for the entire world. The last paragraph stresses the role that Israel should play in the world. And although it requests that the defenders of the Land should be crowned with victory (compare this to Ha'avodah Shebalev, which asks for the well-being and safety of the soldiers, and the Rabbis for Human Rights' prayer, which asks for the restraint of their power), it seeks peace among the nations.

Aharon Loewenschuss, a chemistry professor and a member of Mevakshei Derekh, was not satisfied with this prayer and composed an alternative:

A Prayer on Behalf of **Our People and Our Land**

Ruler of the universe. Accept with favor our prayer for the State of Israel and its people. Pour your blessing upon this land and upon all its inhabitants. Cause us to understand your righteous laws, and implant in our hearts the wisdom of your prophets— "To do justice, to love mercy, and to walk humbly with your God" (Micah 6:8).

Pour out your spirit upon all the inhabitants of our land; plant within us tolerance and mutual respect, uproot hatred, violence, coercion, and exploitation from within us. Spread your tabernacle of peace over the house of Israel in all their dwelling places.

תפילה בעד עמנו ובעד ארצנו

רבון העולם, קבל נא ברצון את תפלתנו למען מדינת ישראל ועמה. הַרַק אָת בַּרַכַתְדְּ עַל הַאַרֵץ וְעַל כל יושביה. הַבִינֵנוּ מִשְׁפַּטֵי צִדְקֵךְ, וְתֵן בִּלְבֵּנוּ - אָת מוּסַר נָבִיאֵיךְ "עשות משפט ואַהבת חסד והצנע לכת עם אלהיך" (מיכה ו, ח). הַעֲרָה רוּחָךְּ עַל כַּל תּוֹשָׁבִי אָרצֵנוּ; טַע בַּנוּ סוֹבִלַנוּת וְכַבוֹד הַדַדִי; עַקר מַתּוֹכֵנוּ שִׁנָאַה, אַלִּימוּת, כָפַיַה וְנָצוּל לְרַע. Pray, place the courage in their souls to come to our land. "and may your children return to their own realm" (Jeremiah 31:16).

Teach us to accept with an open heart those who are gathering to our land.

And strengthen those who are coming to us,

so that they endure the difficulties of their absorption.

And may we dwell in it together in fellowship.

Strengthen the hearts of our soldiers.

the defenders of our land. may their spirit be bold, and their weapons unblemished.

Shield them under the shadow of your wings,

and grant them salvation, so that they may prevail over our enemies.

But pray, grant peace to this land and may all who dwell in it be blessed by it,

speedily fulfill the vision of your prophets:

"Nation shall not lift up sword against nation, neither shall they learn war anymore" (Isaiah 2:4).

פרש את סכת שלומד על בית ישראל בַּכַל תִפוּצוֹתֵיו. אָנַא, תַן עז בָּנַפִּשַם לַבֹא לְאַרְצֵנוּ, וישבנו בה שבת אחים גם יחד. לַמַדֵנוּ לִקבֵּל בַּלָב פַּתוּחַ אַת המתקבצים אֱלֵינוּ, ואת הבאים אלינוּ חזק, לַעֲמֹד בָּקשׁיֵי קלִיטַתַם, ״וִשְׁבוּ בנים לגבוּלם" (ירמיהו לא, טז). אַמֵץ אֶת לֵב חַיַּלֵינוּ, מִגנֵּי אַרִצֵנוּ, וָהַיִתָה רוּחָם עַזַה, וְנִשְׁקַם – טַהוֹר. שומרם בצל כנפיה, הַנְחִילֵם יִשׁוּעָה וְגַבְרוּ עַל אוֹיִבֵינוּ. אַך, אַנַא, תֵּן שַׁלוֹם בַּאַרץ והתברכו בה כל יושביה, וָקַיָּם בָּמָהֶרָה חַזוֹן נָבִיאֵיךּ: "לא ישא גוי אל גוי חרב, ולא ילמדוּ עוֹד מלחמה" (ישעיהו ב, ד).

Loewenschuss explained to me that it became important to him to replace the traditional PSI, as well as the one from Mevakshei Derekh cited above, with a prayer that would accurately reflect what he considered the actual ideology and beliefs of his community. Toward that end, he brought his proposal to the worship committee in the early 1980s, but it took some time before the committee even agreed to consider his composition. Loewenschuss says he "had to leave the sanctuary in anger" before the proposed text was admitted to discussion. Gradually, however, it became the community's preferred text.

Rather than praying solely for the rulers and governing powers of the state, the Loewenschuss text requests wisdom, understanding, and courage for all. Written during the massive immigration from the former Soviet Union, it specifies the well-being of "those who are gathering to our land." The writer, who immigrated to Israel as a child and recalls his family's initial difficulties in the new land, calls for the acceptance of the newcomers "with an open heart." When referring to the military, he asks that it be both courageous and moral, and he concludes the prayer with a request for the peace that will make Israel a blessing to all who dwell in it.

Most of the prayers discussed here were created for (and recited in) non-Orthodox circles. Orthodox communities show less interest in formulating PSIs; Orthodoxy avoids liturgical innovation in general, and ultra-Orthodox authorities reject the prayer in principle because they reject the very concept of Israel as an official Jewish state among the nations. In the National Orthodox community (not the ultra-Orthodox), the official PSI is recited in most synagogues, though the energy with which it is recited varies; it sometimes depends on their support of the government and its policies. Throughout recent decades, especially following the Oslo agreement in 1993 and even more so following the disengagement process from Gaza in 2005, some communities have chosen to make changes to the PSI reflecting their opposition to the current policy of the state.²⁷ In some extremely right-wing groups, the identification with the state has decreased so much that the state is no longer considered the "sprouting of our redemption," and consequently, the prayer is not recited there anymore. In that sense, extreme settlers were in the position of many Jews in the diaspora, relating to a state that they did not consider their own.²⁸ Ironically, some of those in Orthodox circles who were eager to consider the establishment of Israel as a religious event, a stage in the messianic process, now find themselves estranged from it. In most Orthodox synagogues, however, the prayer is still recited with considerable fervor.

Universalism and Particularism, Inclusivity and Exclusivity in the Prayers for the State of Israel

Prayer is conversation. Primarily we speak with God, but we also converse with other people, both those in our community and those outside of it. We even communicate indirectly with those who are not part of our people and religion—although they are probably not aware of our discourse and, indeed, need not be, because the statements we make to or about them are intended for our own benefit as much as for theirs. Prayers reflect the Sitz im Leben, the existential context of those who once composed them, those for whom it was composed, those to whom they now refer, those who actually recite them, and even those who reject them.

If you want to know about Jewish history, the hopes and fears of Jews, if you are interested in opening windows to the souls of Jews, you may want to look into their liturgy and rituals before turning to legal statements or systematic theological essays.²⁹

The prayers for the State of Israel can therefore serve as a test case not just for liturgical innovation but also for identity writ large, as expressed through theology, ideology, and politics.

In that regard, we have seen how current PSIs reflect a current existential situation for Jews who write or recite them. Prayers for the government have been recited by Jews for many centuries, but the composers of the PSIs deliberately overlooked the classical medieval formula (Hanoten T'shuah) and created new ones, precisely because they understood themselves to be living in a new era and an unprecedented situation. As new texts altogether, reflective of the new era not of the liturgical past, the PSI texts have no halakhic (legal), liturgical, or textual constraints and can show significant flexibility. They freely express and assess national, social, and religious sentiments of today.

Finally, what is omitted from the liturgy can sometimes be at least as revealing as what is included. As we saw, for example, the official Israeli Chief Rabbinate PSI contains no reference to the non-Jewish inhabitants of Israel and its neighboring countries. Its composer, Rabbi Herzog, may have wanted to stress its role as an internal Jewish text; he may have seen it as an alternative and religious "Declaration of Independence," this one for Israeli-Jewish use, as opposed to the official Declaration that has been directed to Israelis—to Jews as well as to the world at large. Other texts added but also omitted ideas to express their own changing views of the state's essence, goals, and responsibilities.

Each text aims differently to strike a balance between the need to be part of the family of nations and the desire to stress Israel's own national aspirations.³⁰ They differ, among other things, in commitment to those who are not Jewish; most of the prayers that overtly relate to non-Jews who live in or near Israel stem from the liberal movements. The Orthodox camp is generally less enthusiastic about liturgical innovation and is less apt to show universalistic sensitivity. The few PSIs composed by Orthodox Jews do not relate to non-Jews at all.³¹

As one might expect, diaspora and Israeli texts differ with regard to Israel's role for the Jewish People as a whole. Israeli prayers deal largely with the actual situation in the country and with its concrete goals—we can say that most of them are Israel centered more than they are Jewish People oriented. Most of the diaspora prayers, by contrast, are more likely to highlight Israel as the birthplace of the Jewish People ("for Torah shall come out of Zion" [Isaiah 2:3]) and the locus for future Jewish hopes concerns that provide Israel's somewhat different meaning to diaspora consciousness.

Sacred texts in general (but prayers in particular) set boundaries that distinguish one group from another; in so doing, some differentiate more rigidly than others. Traditional Jewish prayers tend to be on the rigid side, having sometimes either a negative view of others or being unconcerned with them—a reflection of the circumstances of having lived for most of Jewish history, especially in Europe, as a reactive minority. In the Jewish state, however, where Jews are no longer a minority, Jewish selfdefinitions can be proactive—allowing for concern about others without negating manifestations of Jewish nationality, religion, and peoplehood.

- 6. Claude Montefiore, *The Synoptic Gospels*, vol. II (London: Macmillan, 1909), 594.
- 7. For an overview on Jewish understandings of a missionary task, see Reuven Silverman, "Jewish Mission," in *Jewish and Christians: Perspectives on Mission*; The Lambeth-Jewish Forum, ed. Reuven Silverman, Patrick Morrow, and Daniel Langton (Cambridge: Woolf Institute, 2011), 3–21; see also Deborah Prinz, "The Convert among Us" (paper for UAHC Outreach Commission), huc.edu/gerecht/images/sermonsarticles/r.%20prinz%20article; Sue Fishkoff, "The More Jews the Better?" Moment Magazine (July/August 2002), www. beliefnet.com/Faiths/Judaism/2002/07/The-More-Jews-The-Better.aspx?p=1.
- 8. Israel I. Mattuck, "The Missionary Idea," in Aspects of Progressive Jewish Thought, ed. I. I. Mattuck (London: Victor Gollancz, 1954), 49.
- 9. Samuel Holdheim, "This Is Our Task" (1853), translation quoted in W. Gunther Plaut, The Rise of Reform Judaism: A Sourcebook of Its European Origins (New York: World Union for Progressive Judaism, 1963), 138.
- 10. Leo Baeck, Das Wesen des Judentums (1905), 77.
- 11. Leo Baeck, "The Mission of Judaism: Its Later Development and Its Significance for World Judaism Today," in Report of the 6th International WUPI Conference, London, July 14-19, 1949, 72-77.
- 12. Leo Baeck, 1946 Presidential Address to the Fifth International Conference of the World Union for Progressive Judaism.
- 13. Abraham Joshua Heschel, "No Religion Is an Island," Union Theological Seminary Quarterly Review 21, no. 2, pt. 1 (January 1966): 14.

A Sage among the Gentiles? A Halakhic Lesson on Moral Universalism, by Rabbi Daniel Landes

1. Mossad Harav Kook edition of the Mishneh Torah, Rambam Le'Am, vol. 14, p. 398, n. 69.

The Prayer for the State of Israel: Universalism and Particularism, by Rabbi Dalia Marx, PhD

- 1. For example, the blessing recited in the morning service "Blessed ... who did not create me a gentile," a blessing that was changed in liberal liturgy to a positive language: "Blessed ... who created me a Jew." See Joel Kahn, The Three Blessings: Boundaries, Censorship, and Identity in Jewish Liturgy (New York: Oxford University Press, 2011).
- 2. Jonathan Sarna, "Jewish Prayers for the U.S. Government," in Moral Problems in American Life, ed. K. Halttunen and L. Perry (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1998), 202.
- 3. See Joseph Tabory, "The Piety of Politics: Jewish Prayers for the State of Israel," in Liturgy in the Life of the Synagogue: Studies in the History of Jewish Prayer, ed. Ruth Langer and Steven Fine (Winona Lake, IN: Eisenbrauns, 2005), esp. 229-31. For examples of such prayers, see David Golinkin, "Prayers for the Government and the State of Israel," 2006, Schechter Institute website, www.schechter.edu/insightIsrael.aspx?ID=35.

- 4. Sefer Abudraham Hashalem (Jerusalem: T'khiyah, 1963), 136.
- 5. Barry Schwartz, "Hanoten Teshua': The Origin of the Traditional Jewish Prayer for the Government," Hebrew Union College Annual 57 (1986): 113-20.
- 6. Regarding the leadership of the founder of Chabad, see, e.g., Samuel Heilman and Menachem Friedman, The Rebbe: The Life and Afterlife of Menachem Mendel Schneerson (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2010).
- 7. Siddur Hashalom (Moscow 1956, 1968) contains special prayers for the leaders of the USSR, "the defenders of peace in the entire world."
- 8. See Sarna, "Jewish Prayers," 204-5.
- 9. See Aharon Arend, Pirkey Mechkar L'yom Ha'atsma'ut (Ramat Gan, Israel: Bar Ilan University, 1998), 176-200; Rabbi Dalia Marx, "Liturgical Responses to the Disengagement Process in Summer 2005" [in Hebrew], Akdamot 18 (2007): 119–39; Joel Rappel, *The Prayer for the State of Israel* (forthcoming).
- 10. Regarding the Prayer for the State of Israel, see Joel Rappel, *The Convergence* of Politics and Prayer: Jewish Prayers for the Government and the State of Israel (Boston: Academic Studies Press, 2008); Tabory, "The Piety of Politics."
- 11. See Rappel, Prayer for the State of Israel.
- 12. Ibid.
- 13. References to the Arab countries do appear in the different versions of Al Hanissim, another Israeli-Zionist liturgical innovation. (See Rabbi Dalia Marx, "Al Hanissim for Yom Ha'atsma'ut," forthcoming.)
- 14. Rappel, Prayer for the State of Israel.
- 15. In some cases one may say that *Ha'avodah Shebalev* reflects a hyper-Zionist perspective, much more accented than in traditional prayer books. See Rabbi Dalia Marx, "Ideology, Theology, and Style in Israeli Reform Liturgy," CCAR Journal (Winter 2010): 52-62.
- 16. See Uriel Tal, "Contemporary Hermeneutics and Self-Views on the Relationship between State and Land," in The Land of Israel: Jewish Perspectives, ed. Rabbi Lawrence A. Hoffman (Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 1986), 316-38.
- 17. See Michael Meyer, Response to Modernity: A History of the Reform Movement in Judaism (New York: Oxford University Press, 1988), esp. 326–34.
- 18. Gates of Prayer also contains a "meditation," titled "Land of Hope and Prayer" (p. 240), composed by Rabbi Stephan O. Parnes. It appears as a personal text, not as part of the communal service. This text, slightly revised, is printed also in the U.S. military siddur from 1984.
- 19. "Fathers" became, in the 2008 edition, "[God of the] generations"; "all mankind" was changed to "all." I thank Rabbi Jonathan Magonet, for the information regarding the creation of this text and its evolvement.
- 20. Daily Prayer Book of the United Hebrew Congregations of the British Empire, 1890. It had been issued by the office of Chief Rabbi Nathan Marcus Adler and provided with an English translation by Rabbi Simon Singer, whence it received its name.

- 21. The prayer appears originally in Hebrew and German; I translated it into English. In some circles, both liberal and more traditional, this change to the jussive is currently made in the way the words are spoken aloud, even if the written version does not already contain it.
- 22. After fierce discussions on this question, the editing committee of the Israeli Reform Passover Haggadah, Haggadah Lazman Hazeh, decided to keep the traditional text but to add the jussive form in parentheses (Jerusalem, 2009,
- 23. Aryeh Cohen, quoted in Ruth Andrew Ellenson, "Avant-Garde L.A. Minyan Adopts Prayer for Zion," Forward, June 28, 2002.
- 24. Cohen, ibid.
- 25. Translation by Ariella Radwin and Aryeh Cohen.
- 26. For a discussion of the references of the Holocaust in modern prayer books, see Rabbi Dalia Marx, "Memorializing the Holocaust," in May God Remember: Memory and Memorializing in Judaism-Yizkov, Prayers of Awe, ed. Rabbi Lawrence A. Hoffman (Woodstock, VT: Jewish Lights, 2012), 39-62.
- 27. See above, note 10.
- 28. It is hard to collect data reflecting this phenomenon; sometimes it seems that the press exaggerates its proportions.
- 29. Cf., in general, Lawrence A. Hoffman, "The Liturgical Message," in Gates of Understanding, ed. Rabbi Lawrence A. Hoffman (New York: Union of American Hebrew Congregations, 1977), 1:117-31; Rabbi Lawrence A. Hoffman "Jewish Liturgy and American Experience," Religion and Intellectual Life 5, no. 1 (Fall 1987): 71-80; Rabbi Lawrence A. Hoffman, Beyond the Text: A Holistic Approach to Liturgy (Bloomington: Indiana University Press), 1987.
- 30. This chart, albeit general and schematic, may show the evolvement of the tension between particularism and universalism in liberal liturgy:

	Particularism	Universalism
Traditional prayer	+	(-)
Classic Reform prayer	-	+
Contemporary Liberal prayer	+	+

31. A conspicuous exception to this rule is a prayer composed by Rabbi Shmuel Avidor Hakohen, who was ordained by Rabbi Herzog, the composer of the official PSI. The last paragraph of his PSI begins with the following words:

Our Heavenly Father, bless us, our neighbors and all the nations of the world, and fulfill the words of the prophet, "Nation shall not lift up sword against nation, neither shall they learn war any more" (Isa. 2:4).

אבינו שבשמים, ברך אותנו, את שכנינו ואת כל עמי תבל, למען יקוימו בנו דברי הנביא: 'לֹא ישׂא גוי אַל גוי חַרב וַלֹא יַלְמִדוּ עוֹד מלחמה' (ישעיהו ב, ד). I thank Rabbi Lawrence A. Hoffman, the editor of this book, and Rabbi Shelton Donnell for their abundant help, as well as Dr. Joel M. Hoffman for his translation of some of the Hebrew prayers into English. I also thank the people who helped me collect the prayers for the State of Israel and those who allowed me to use the prayers they composed: Rabbi Aryeh Cohen, Professor Aharon Loewenschuss, Rabbi Jonathan Magonet, Rabbi Yehoram Mazor, Orna Meir-Stacey, Paul Piwnicki, and Dr. Joel Rappel. Every effort has been made to trace and acknowledge the copyright holders for the material included in this chapter. The contributor apologizes for any errors or omissions that may remain and asks that any omissions be brought to her attention so that they may be corrected in future editions.

The Music of *V'ye'etayu*—"All the World," by Dr. Mark L. Kligman

1. Jeffrey Shiovitz, ed., *Zamru Lo: The Next Generation*, vol. 2 (New York: Cantors Assembly, 2006), 148–49.

For a Judaism of Human Concerns, by Rabbi Walter Homolka, PhD, DHL

- 1. Bradley Shavit Artson, "Building a Future Worthy of Our Past," blog on the *Times of Israel*, December 1, 2013.
- 2. Hermann Cohen, *Religion of Reason Out of the Sources of Judaism* (Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press, 1995), 452.
- 3. Artson, "Building a Future."

Is Judaism Too Important to Be Left Just to Jews? The Sh'ma and the Alenu, by Rabbi Reuven Kimelman, PhD

1. See Sifrei Deuteronomy 32, ed. Finkelstein, p. 54.

עלינו: הוא אלהינו אין עוד אמת מלכנו אפס זולתו 2.

שמע של ערבית: אמת... הוא יי אלהינו ואין זולתו שמע של שחרית: אמת אלהי עולם מלכנו

Alenu: hu eloheinu ein od **emet** malkeinu efes zulato Shema shel arvit: **emet** hu adonai eloheinu v'ein zulato

Shema shel shaharit: **emet** elohei olam malkeinu

Alenu: He is our God, there is no other; **truly** our king, none besides Him Evening Sh'ma: **Truly**, He is Adonai our God there is no one besides Him Morning Sh'ma: **Truly** the eternal God is our king

3. Esther Rabbah 1:4 (end).